Exploring Marxist Perspective Amidst Exploitation and False Consciousness in Hosain’s *The Old Man*

Muhammad Hamzah Masood1,2*, Shahzeb Shafi1

1Department of English, University of Management and Technology (UMT), Lahore, Pakistan,
2Department of English Studies, National University of Modern Languages (NUML), Islamabad, Pakistan,
3Shah Abdul Latif University (SALU), Sindh, Pakistan

**Corresponding Author:** Muhammad Hamzah Masood, E-mail: jorkyell@gmail.com

**ARTICLE INFO**

**Article history**
Received: February 10, 2020
Accepted: April 17, 2020
Published: May 31, 2020
Volume: 9  Issue: 3
Advance access: May 2020

Conflicts of interest: None
Funding: None

**ABSTRACT**

History has witnessed the exploitation of working class at the hands of ruling class since the very beginning of mankind. This exploitation has always led the poor to the state of false consciousness. Karl Marx has pointed out this social injustice in his theory. This research is an attempt to find Marxist elements of exploitation and false consciousness in the short story *The Old Man* by Attia Hosain, which is written in the context of subcontinent. Current study has incorporated the textual method of analysis through the lens of the proposition of Karl Marx about the behaviour of the bourgeoisie towards the proletariat. The study is qualitative in nature where descriptive method of textual analysis is utilized to look for and examine the instances of exploitation and false consciousness. The major finding of research depicts that the upper class has always exploited the poor and the poor who have false consciousness bear all inhumane behaviour without any resistance. Thus, it is the view that exploitation and false consciousness pose difficulties and hardships for the poor class.

**Key words:** Poverty, Marxist Elements, Exploitation, False Consciousness, Class Distinction

**INTRODUCTION**

Literature and social life are closely interlinked with each other. Plethora of writers state the occurrence with ambivalent emotions by observing the surroundings. As Peck and Coyle (1993, p. 178) in Literary Terms and Criticism stated, “The sociology of literature emphasizes literature as an important tool to convey a message to society about the reality of those around them.” Current study seeks to see society through the canvas of literature by taking into account Marxist views especially about exploitation of workers and false consciousness of the poor as depicted by Attia Hosain in the short story *The Old Man*.

Society is the mixture of the upper and lower Classes. Owing to imbalance of wealth, the lower class mostly becomes a victim in one way or another by the upper class. Class distinction and injustice lead to class struggle that has negative effects especially on the survival of the lower classes and which is a licence to the high up dominant class to oppress and exploit their subservient the way they like. Karl Marx, in opposition to these inhumane acts, presented the idea of equal distribution of wealth in the society that can make the society a paradise on earth.

Exploitation is a phenomenon defined by Karl Marx as the poor working class in capitalist society is forced to sell its manpower to the upper class for the values less than they deserve. The upper class takes them as their servants and uses them for their own benefits. According to Marxist school of thought, false consciousness is a notion in which the proletariat unwittingly misunderstands and misperceives their interest and real position in capitalistic society. It also indicates people’s lack of capability to be aware of exploitation, injustice and oppression exercised by upper class.

Many authors reflect the exploitation and false consciousness through their works. Although the Indian subcontinent has produced a few of them, they are able to depict these social conditions of their respective societies. Among them, a female Muslim literary writer Attia Hosain is a prominent journalist, broadcaster, feminist novelist and short story writer. The short story taken here is *The Old Man* by Attia Hosain from a collection of short stories *Distant Traveller: New and Selected Fiction*, Edited and Selected by Aamer Hussein and Shama Habibullah, published by Oxford University Press Pakistan in 2017. The basic motif behind this short story is to highlight the barbaric nature of the rich families who for the satisfaction of their ego torture the poor working class. The minions living a life of serfdom under the upper class, owing to their false consciousness refrain from voicing the disgruntled emotions against their demigod.
Statement of the Problem and Research Questions
Exploitation of the poor for vested interests leads to many negative consequences such as poverty, injustice and inequity in society. The rich usually own factories or other such institutions where the poor work and get daily or weekly wages. All the social institutions are being controlled by the rich including law and justice due to which poor is always suppressed and rich remains dominant. The society is further exacerbated by the non-resistance and embracing injustice without demur due to the false consciousness ingrained in the minds of the exploited. This issue has been discussed by many writers but the present study will scrutinize the short story The Old Man by Attia Hosain by focusing on the attitude of the elite towards the helpless, hapless abjectly poor workers. The researcher aims at answering the following questions:

How does the selected short story The Old Man by Attia Hosain highlight the aspect of exploitation of the working class at the hands of the rich?

How does the theme of false consciousness prevail in the selected Attia Hosain’s story The Old Man?

Research Objectives
The objectives of this study are as follows:

To highlight the exploitation of the poor working class at the hands of the rich in the short story The Old Man by Attia Hosain

To find out the elements of false consciousness in the short story The Old Man by Attia Hosain

Significance of Study
As least research has been conducted on this story so far so this research will provide motivation to other researchers for conducting research on this short story from different perspectives. This research study will be significant in a way that it will highlight the pressing issue that the poor class is facing. This research study would be a contribution to the field of literature especially in understanding the short story The Old Man from Distant Traveller written by Attia Hosain from Marxist perspective and would add to the theoretical framework of Marxist perspective. The same theme can be found out for future study in Pakistani literature in English as well.

Delimitations
Some limitations to this research study are as:

There are 15 short stories in Distant Traveller but this study is only limited to the analysis of textual content representing Marxist perspective in the short story The Old Man.

The research is delimited to exploitation and false consciousness perspectives within Marxism theory.

Organization of Study
The nature of this research is qualitative which tends to explore the short story The Old Man from Marxist perspective.

This research study comprises the following sections:
Section 1. Introduction
Section 2. Literature Review
Section 3. Methodology
Section 4. Findings and Discussion
Section 5. Conclusion.

LITERATURE REVIEW
This section deals with reviving the previous articles in the light of the theme of exploitation and false consciousness under Marxist perspective.

Matt and Alan (2017) gave the idea of exploitation of Karl Marx in The Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy “Workers are forced to sell their labour power to capitalists for less than the full value of the commodities they produce with their labour”. As Karl Marx pointed out, false consciousness is a mind-set inculcated into the belief of the working class or those of the subordinates so that they may think their life being inevitable and in such a manner, the working class regards the owners as their inevitable masters (Jameson, p. 281).

A German philosopher and sociologist, Karl Marx (1818-1883) and Friedrich Engels (1820-1895) founded Marxism school of thought. They both wrote Communist Manifesto (1848) and proclaimed the rise of Communism which may cope with ideology, economy and history. A number of Marxist perspectives are presented by French theoretician Louis Althusser (1918-1990) like Freudo-Marxism and structuralism. Emerging from Marxist ideology, Althusser proposes that art is something which makes us aware of our own existence in the society as art is representation of the society itself. It was through this proposition that the ideology of Marxism was extended to literature on theoretical level.

Marxism is a very broad and renowned concept in the field of literary criticism and as such it consists of different concepts and perspectives. One of the most well-known Marxist concepts is Feudalism. In term of economic characteristics, Karl Marx in the 19th century used this term. Coulburn says “Feudalism is not social or an economic system but a method of government which is revamp by economic and social environment. In this type of government, the relation is essential among lord and vassal not within subject and ruler nor state and citizen” (Coulburn, 1956, p. 2-4).

Another concept is Proletariat. It is used to describe the working class which earns money from industrial production by selling their labour power. “This class would have characterized as the most oppressed passively suffering poverty-ridden class capable, at best, only of a desperate hungry rebellion” (Azeri, 2013, p. 2-3).

Larsson (2017) states that the reader of Marx recognizes the concept false consciousness as the pitiable state of affairs when a man happens to be mistaken regarding the truth of his own motives, ideas and actions. Guided by a false ideology, the unlucky citizen slipped into illusion, has indulged in abstractions, or simply failed to understand the real motivations behind his own actions – or that of others.

The data collected through discourse analysis of the text as well as other related books of criticism are evaluated from
different perspectives to prove that Conrad actually exposes the real savagery or darkness hidden inside the cloak of white civilization in his novel, Heart of Darkness. Being a vast field of literary criticism, numerous studies have been conducted in the field of Marxism and is still being explored. Among those studies conducted, one of the important studies is by Ruman (2013) in which through the help of discourse analysis of the text, he has explored the dark side of the civilized white savage European people, who in the lust for power, brutally exploited the indigenous for their self-centred motives as their slaves. They used them as a product and considered them garbage after getting benefits.

A study was conducted by Paikrao (2013), mentioned through thematic analysis of novel, the sufferings and difficulties of the oppressed and low class due to neo-feudalism which was taking its roots in that epoch of time in India. Feudalism and patriarchal society exploited and thrust the lower caste to margin, especially, the women. In an extremely corrupt system of class consciousness, the poor did not have enough money to spend on the medical treatment of their kin whereas the upper class had heaps of money but they were not ready to spend even a single penny on their old relatives however to gain prestige, they spent plenty of money on their death ceremonies. The working poor class is exploited by awfully corrupt pastoral system of dominant class for personal benefits.

Exploitation and false consciousness are the key factors that spoil the peace of the society. These things are mostly found in the world especially in third world countries. Sulochana (2014) an Indo-Anglian writer used multiple aspect of analysis like thematic, plot and character analysis to underscore social exploitation by the British colonizer and upper class of the poor working class. The researcher underlined how the poor working family moved to a far off jungle to sell their labour on demand of the white due to hazard life and how they were brutally exploited and oppressed by their masters even after their tough labour from morning to evening on less than three annas which were even not enough to purchase any food item. They were considered sub-human, beaten and sexually abused by their masters. The researcher projected corrupt system of class in the society which exploited the labour of the poor.

Another study is done by Fadli, Dahlan and Humairah (2015) by following the historical approach aspects that explain relationship of a literary piece of writing with history in which they presented the unfair treatment and exploitation of the native American Indian by the white that caused poverty in the society. The white migrated to that place and held the economy in the same way as they did many years ago by beating and robbing the natives. Owing to this, the poor grew poorer. The study highlights the miserable life of one of the Native American Indian who has no money to pay to the White doctor to get his child cured. By luck, he found out a pearl and dreamt of getting his son cured and educated but the economy holder forced him to sell the pearl at a very low price. On his refusal, they tried to steal the pearl and in that situation the Native American Indian’s son got killed. The white, rich class had every facility but they did not even allow the poor American Indians to get education. They wanted them to remain uneducated to exploit them.

Sirs (2015) by doing thematic analysis of the novel Coolie of Mulk Raj Anand by following the technique of textual analysis highlighted class differences, injustice and various kinds of exploitation of the poor by the rich people. She also mentioned the behaviour of the British colonizers towards colonized one: India. The Britishers abused and misbehaved the Indians. The upper class even, without having much money, had slaves in the form of servants for maintaining life standards. They had no care for the poor. The downtrodden working class even was punished brutally for stealing food for a meal of a day.

Another study was conducted by Jayasri and Reddy (2018) on themes of economic challenges and poverty in Mulk Raj Anand novel Untouchable. The examiners highlighted the situations in which the poor, low caste, working class was exploited by the high caste people. As the reward of their hard and honest labour, they were humiliated and had to face several economic challenges. Their study puts a picture of the life of twenty four hours in which the poor low caste Punjabi: Indian faced maltreatment on begging food, humiliating remarks on just entering a temple and slap the face only on being touched to another person even on seeking an apology on his unconscious act. The helpless poor class was extremely exploited and disgraced just only due to their haplessness.

Another study was conducted by Deivasigamani and Saravanan (2018) by doing the textual analysis of the novel Disgrace. They projected injustice, exploitation and maltreatment with the subaltern class especially the oppressed, suppressed, voiceless and helpless women who were tortured mentally as well as physically by patriarchal society and corrupt system. They were pushed to work as prostitutes; some were abused by people of relatively upper class and some were made to perform humiliating jobs like upkeeping dogs and some others were ravished and stigmatized to such an extent that spending the rest of their lives in seclusion became the only viable option for them.

From aforementioned works, it can be asserted that Marxist theory of exploitation and false consciousness is applied to different literary works in the domain of literature. Qualitative research was conducted to show injustice and ill-treatment with the suppressed poor working class at the hands of the demigod in the society i.e. the upper class. This very thing is dominant in the literary works of Subcontinent which need to be discovered. Based on this proposition, Attia Hosain’s short story The Old Man, still needs a deep and detailed study and analysis from a Marxist perspective, and as such, offers a gap in knowledge which is yet to be discovered.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The purpose of this unit is to give the outlines of the methodology involved in carrying out this research study. It includes the sample for research study, design and method of research study and theoretical framework. Moreover, this section elaborates the procedure followed while conducting this research study.
The sample, from which data is extracted for analysis and discussion, is the short story *The Old Man* by Attia Hosain. As she was one of the first female English literary figures at the time of independence, her major works comprised the theme of exploitation, suppression and false consciousness for which it was necessary to explore it further.

The textual method of analysis that gives insight into the text is incorporated in this research study to behold the Marxist perspective and its instances in the text. This research is qualitative in nature. Collection and analysis of data is in the form of text or qualitative form and the portion of discussion and conclusion is totally based on the background knowledge of the researcher and his own perspective.

**Framework: Theory of Exploitation and False Consciousness**

As regards theoretical framework, it is based on *Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts of 1884* by Karl Marx, “The worker in his human functions no longer feels himself to be anything but animal. What is animal becomes human and what is human becomes animal” (1959, p. 30).

According to Karl Marx, workers due to false belief in their minds that they cannot survive without the help of their masters consider themselves nothing but animals. They bear all the brutal acts done by the upper class silently like animals and do not speak against them. On the other hand, the so-called civilized upper class takes advantage of false consciousness of the poor working class and exploits them for its vested interests. It shows the animalistic characteristic while giving no care to the poor class.

The research study is based on the theoretical framework proposed by Marx. It enunciates the idea of exploitation and false consciousness that the upper class exploits its subordinates in every field of life for its personal benefits and satisfaction of the ego whereas the exploited ones take that exploitation as granted, submit themselves to destiny and bear everything without any feeling of revolt. In the short story *The Old Man* by Attia Hosain, the element of exploitation and false consciousness can be witnessed as we go through the text.

In order to carry out this research, the procedure used by the researcher is of reading the short story *The Old Man* from *Distant Traveller* by Attia Hosain thoroughly and by finding out the theme of exploitation and false consciousness keeping in view the Marxist perspective through given description of the selected text, and thus, discussing and analysing the text by referring back to the source text and taking examples from it.

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS**

The section, data analysis, deals with the collection and analysis of the data upon which this research study is based. This research study analyses the selected textual examples in the Marxist perspective: exploitation and false consciousness from *The Old Man* a short story by Attia Hosain. In the current project, the researcher has traced out certain instances of text out of the short story which depict the theme of exploitation and false consciousness which lie under the Marxist perspective to show the bourgeois behaviour towards proletariats.

**Exploitation of the Working Class at the Hands of the Rich**

Cambridge English Dictionary defines exploitation as “the act of using someone unfairly for your own advantage.” The theme of exploitation is evident in the following texts:

**Text No. 1:**

“Now, don’t blink. Look carefully at the light. Don’t dare to blink. At each roar the old mouth quivered, and the unblinking staring eyes slowly filled with tears that gathered, then dripped and trickled down the furrows” (Hosain, 2015, p. 99).

In the short story, *The Old Man*, a government official who works under “Director Saheb” supervising some young and old peasants on a farm, exploits the old man who belongs to the working class just to satisfy his ego. The old man who, due to his age, unintentionally interrupts his master’s song and tells the wrong time to him and faces horrible inhumane treatment. He over and again, says as if speaking to himself, “It is now eleven o’clock. It is now eleven o’clock. It is now eleven o’clock. All’s well, all’s well” (Hosain, 2015, p. 97). This repetition of phrases shows the mental condition of the old man which may be ruined by continuous torture of his master. He utters “eleven o’clock”, while on the clock, there is ten. Just owing to this mistake, his master gets furious.

The above mentioned lines of the text are the evidence how he is brutally treated by his master. His master turns on the torch light directing it to his face and orders him not to blink. Obviously, one could not bear the intensity of such brutal behaviour. On top of that, being an aged person; it doubles the intensity, thus the old man bursts into tears. This shows the worse type of exploitation by the wealthy man.

**Text No. 2:**

“Now we will find out if you are deaf.’ He held the heavy gong near the man’s ear and struck it one, twice, three times. Each time the man jerked his head back” (Hosain, 2015, p. 99).

Owing to old age, the old man; the peasant, could not hear the time striking 10, and misjudged the time being 11, infuriates the master and he, the master, decides to teach him a lesson in a rather brutal manner. He forces the old man to listen to the jarring and loud gong held close to his ear.

These lines show the cruel reaction of the master on the minor mistake of the old man. In order to torture the old man, he strikes the heavy gong near his ear. The old man jerks his head back. The sound is too high that even the young narrator who is watching this incident is forced to cover his ears. The above lines show the cruel nature of the man in power in every respect. He exploits his peasant just to satisfy his ego.

As Karl also says that with power, human becomes animal, so does the master in the short story.

**Text No. 3:**

“……., you haven’t danced yet. Show us your dance. Now then…” He clapped the rhythm,” (Hosain, 2015, p. 100)

After inflicting torture on the old man by striking the huge gong close to his ears, the cruel master does not get satisfaction. The old man has corrected his mistake by saying “It is now ten
**False Consciousness**

False consciousness is a way of thinking in individuals who do not realize their position in the society. Following texts elaborate the false consciousness prevailing in the society.

**Text No. 1:**

"... they know no language but the one I talk to them in. They respect men with strong arms and a biting tongue" (Hosain, 2015, p. 97).

The master refuses to accept the modern way of farming which can change the farm and the condition of the peasants. He knows that modern world teaches good behaviour and care for others whether they are masters or subordinates. The master of the peasants wants to enjoy the power over the weak subordinates. He thinks that there is no scope for the use of soft words in language while it is used with subordinates. He says that the peasants only understand the language he speaks that is harsh and inhumane. They only respect the person who is strong in every respect. The writer describes the bitterness of the master’s tongue as:

"You little owl, are you dead or palsied" (Hosain, 2015, p. 97).

"Hey, you, son of a pig" (Hosain, 2015, p. 98).

"... Useless old idiot" (Hosain, 2015, p. 99).

The quoted lines from the text show how the stronger one treats the weaker ones. These remarks are highly immoral. The powerful thinks that he has licence to say anything to the weaker ones. The master has a false notion that peasants can only understand the bitter language. He is brutally ruining the feelings and emotions of the workers who have the same heart as other human beings. He exploits others’ emotions just to satisfy his tyrant ego.

All kinds of maltreatment emerge in society when the weaker one does not resist but bears all the oppression, injustice, harsh words and cruelty without any second thought. Zoonen (2017) states that false consciousness is “a way of thinking that prevents people from perceiving the true nature of their social or economic situation”. The weaker ones lie under false consciousness. They think that they cannot survive without the stronger and the wealthier. With this false belief, they do not dare to change their position and resist their masters. False consciousness which comes under Marxist perspective greatly prevails in this short story.

**Text No. 2:**

"Did you dare to say no? I would rather die, your honour" (Hosain, 2015, p. 101).

The master gets amused in exploiting the poor old man. The old man refuses when the master asks him to take a ride in his car by considering himself as unworthy as the writer describes:

"Oh no, your honour, I am too unworthy" (Hosain, 2015, p. 101).

He is a human being. He is worthy of taking a ride but he considers himself inappropriate; the very essence of false consciousness. This thing shows the submissive behaviour of the peasant, the old man. On hearing this refusal from the old man, the master gets furious and puts a question which shows his power how the weaker one can say no to the master. The weak supressed old man shows his submissiveness by saying that he would like to die rather saying no to his master which is the height of his submission and obedience.

These lines show the old man’s state of mind who is bearing all these inhumane acts without showing any resistance.
He is utterly in the state of false consciousness. He is bearing all these oppressions because he has the false notion that his survival without his master is impossible. He thinks that he can be kicked out from this place as he is kicked out from his daughter-in-law’s house. That false belief prevents him from speaking against injustice rather he absorbs all the brutal doings in his chest. Jost (1995) states false consciousness, “The holding of false beliefs that are contrary to one’s social interest and which thereby contribute to the disadvantaged position of the self or the group”. An Urdu poet Shifai states about those people who, without resistance, bear all the injustice saying nothing:

ویہوں قریب تو ذہن اس سے ایشیٹ ہو رہا ہے
ئس کی نہ ہو شکا ہے۔ انسان وہ بھی جوہ

The old man with the false belief is contributing to the disadvantaged position to the self. The silence from the oppressed one adds fuel to the fire of inhumane behavior.

Text No. 3:
“The next master might beat me more” (Hosain, 2015, p. 101).

The story ends up with the above mentioned line spoken by the old man when the narrator asks him about his master as the writer describes:

“Are you happy he is going?
He looked up suspiciously. ‘No, no, why should I be?’” (Hosain, 2015, p. 101).

The lower suppressed class is always maltreatment by the upper class. This thing gains its worst shape when the oppressed people of the working class seal their lips against the brutality of the high class because of their false belief that their master is the only one who can give them sustenance to live and without their master, they cannot remain alive. This thing gives licence to the owners to exploit their subordinates as they like. The old man in the short story is victim due to his false consciousness. He always responds to his master in a very polite manner even after hearing harsh words from him. As the author describes:

“Come close.
Yes, your honour.”

“Do you know what time it is?
Long before mid-night, your honour.”

“Oh no, your honour, I am too unworthy”

“Did you dare to say no?”

“I would rather die, your honour.”

These dialogues show the polite attitude of the old man due to his false consciousness even bearing tortures and harsh words. He, at the end, says that the next master might beat him more. Because of his false belief, he does not get ready to leave that place and find out a new honourable job which suits to his age. He is happy with his old master’s cruelty. This is the false consciousness that leads the poor suppressed and oppressed working class from bad to worse condition and gives free hand to the upper class to exploit them as freely as they want because the suppressed one does not want to change his condition. The exploitation from the upper class will continue till the resistance of the working class. If they do not want any change due to their false consciousness, nothing can change their condition. As Allah says in the Noble Quran:

“Verily, Allah will not change the condition of a people until they change what is in their heart.” (Quran, 13: 11)

As mentioned in the world greatest book that people’s condition cannot change until or unless they try to change it, Khan (1937) has also stated this thing in his couplet:

ولیکہ رہیں سلیخ میں مرت سا کہ چا چا سین اذ کہ ٹیڑھ کہ سا سلیخ ہو ہو سا نا لاریخ وک سرچ ہو ہو ہو

False consciousness will continue paving way for exploitation until the suppressed people change their point of view. As is evident from the above two glance examples, man has been advised to struggle for his rights and break the shackles which restrain his freedom; the essential right of human beings, and stop believing in his dependence upon others lest false consciousness should continue paving way for exploitation until the suppressed change their point of view.

CONCLUSION
Conclusively, our society has been divided into upper and lower class not only on the basis of money, but also on the basis of manners, thoughts, ideas and social treatment. The rich man believes that he has the power over all his subordinates. He is also inhumane and unkind towards the poor. The powerful rich man thinks that he has the licence to exploit the poor for his vested interests. He even exploits others just to satisfy his ego. On the other hand, the weaker ones bear all kinds of misbehaviour with the idea that they cannot live without the help of the wealthy powerful people. Many critics as well as writers have mentioned this exploitation, torture, and inhumane treatment towards poor in every age. Attia Hosain has also mentioned this filthy attitude of the rich in her short story The Old Man.

This study has shown that Attia Hosain, the short story writer of subcontinent, has incorporated instances of exploitation and false consciousness in the text which fall under the Marxist perspective. This research study meets the desired research goals as it explains the exploitation of the poor at the hands of the rich by quoting and explaining Hosain’s short story in which the submissive attitude of the old man depicted the poor working class in the state of false consciousness and his cruel master portrayed upper class who always exploit the poor; all of this is represented and clearly elaborated, as an answer to, in accordance with the questions that are proposed in this study.

This research study suggests the syntactic analysis of the short story The Old Man how the writer uses Attia Hosain different writing techniques in her writings. Moreover, the researchers in future can carry out the research through the perspective of discourse analysis how the upper and the lower class use their language in the short story, The Old Man.

REFERENCES