



# Representation of Oriental Travelers and Locus in Jürgen Wasim Frembgen's Travelogue: *The Closed Valley: With Fierce Friends in Pakistani Himalays*

Ahmad Gholi

English Department, Faculty of Humanities, Gonbad Kavous University, Iran

E-mail: ahmadgholi0098@gmail.com

Received: 27-06-2016

Accepted: 01-09-2016

Advance Access Published: November 2016

Published: 02-01-2017

doi:10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.6n.1p.84

URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.6n.1p.84>

## Abstract

The oft despised and ignored genre of travel writing was recognized as worthy of scholarly investigation in 1970s thanks to Edward Said's *Orientalism*, the wave of deconstructionism, and postcolonialism (Calzati, 2015). For these scholars, travel writers do not present a transparent window to an alien space and its residents even though they normally claim it. For them the representation of the traveled terrain and travelers is an ideological construction which is tainted with the travel writer's 'habitus' and 'field' and crafted through fictional devices. In this regard, by drawing on postcolonial methodology, the current study seeks to evince how Frembgen in his travelogue, *The Closed Valley: With Fierce Friends in Pakistani Himalays* which narrates his voyage to Harban, a far-flung mountainous region in Pakistan Himalaya, reproduces the pitfalls of previous Western travel writers when he depicts his destination and travelers in negative terms. From his perspective, his timeless traveled locus is rife with violence, yet a space to escape from dehumanizing ambience of the West. Additionally, for him the women in this tribal region are tyrannized by husbands and victimized by Muslim extremists. Last but not least, he portrays this remote oriental space as an object of curiosity which needs to be salvaged textually.

**Keywords:** Travel Writing, Timeless, Escape, Women, Violence, Curiosity

## 1. Introduction

### 1.1 Travel, Travel writing, and History of Travel Writing

According to *Webster's New World Dictionary*, the word "travel" is related to "travail" which in turn is derived from a Vulgar Latin word: '*tripalium*' meaning "an instrument of torture composed of three stakes" and it is etymologically consisted of *tri* (three) and *palus* (a stake). The root of the word indicates that at the heart of it lies the concept of mental and physical suffering (Gholi, 2015). By definition, travel refers to a movement in time and space during which negotiation (sometimes confrontation) between self/identity and other/alterity takes place (Thompson, 2011). There has been bipolar cultural attitude towards travel. Plato bars the residents of his imaginary and well-controlled Republic except old and trustworthy people from undertaking a journey to the outside world since he assumed that the customs and practices of alien terrains can corrupt the travelers and encourage them to disseminate lies<sup>i</sup> (Harbsmeier, 2010). Likewise, Washington Irving discourages the young from traveling abroad, thinking that it will render them effeminate and luxurious (Bendixon, 2009). Equally, Emerson in his *Self-Reliance* exhibits his disapproval of the travel by calling it as a fool's paradise (ibid.). In marked contrast to Plato, Irving, and Emerson, there are writers who look at the bright side of travel. Marry Wollstonecraft lauds it for inducing travelers to examine their prejudices, and terminate them imperceptibly (Gilroy, 2010). Savary similarly values the instructive role<sup>ii</sup> of travel,

Travelling is man's most instructive school. It is by travelling that he is able to know his fellow men; it is by living with other peoples, by studying their customs, their religion, their government, that he has a standard of comparison by which he can judge the customs, religion, and government of his country (as cited in Behdad, 2009, p.86).

Mark Cocker also exalts it as "one of the greatest doors to human freedom" (as cited in Thompson, 2011, p.6). According to Paul and Janet Starkey (2001) travelers in particular Western ones have executed their journeys for the variety of motives both good and bad, "they have traveled on pilgrimages; they have set out in pursuit of knowledge, of power, diplomacy and trade; they have traveled for pleasure and adventure, to plunder and to discover the exotic-or simply to discover themselves" (p.1). Travel is interlaced with literature. This explains why Peter Hume claims that "there is no statuesque literature" (as cited in Youngs, 2013, p.4). Equally Certeau notes that "every story is a travel story" (as cited in Berger, 2009, p. 98). Blanton (1997) similarly remarks that journey motif is one of the most frequent types of narrative. Thus it is an ubiquitous pattern not only in classical works such as *The Odyssey*, *Gulliver's Travels*,

and *Don Quixote* (Berger, 2009), but also in modernist novels like *The Voyage out, Passage to India, The Sun Also Rises, and Voyage in the Dark* (Peat, 2011).

Travel has been an inalienable part of humans' life and there have been different types of travelers with various missions and intentions since early times; notwithstanding, the number of travel books in comparison with other literary forms are limited, contrary to expectation. Travel writing which is known as travel literature, the literature of travel, the travel genre, travel narrative, travel book, traveler's tale, and travel journal, travel memoir (Borm, 2004) eludes any clear and precise definition (Holland & Huggan, 1998). This can be explained by its incorporation of other genres in itself as Jonathon Raban points to it,

As a literary form travel writing is a notoriously raffish open house where every different genres are likely to end up in same bed. It accommodates the private diary, the essay, the short story, the prose poem, the rough note and polished table talk with indiscriminate hospitality (as cited in Youngs, 2013, p.2).

Despite its recalcitrant nature, travel scholars have sought to define it, albeit not comprehensively. For Campbell (1988) travel writing is a type of witness whose main target and concern is truth. Fussell describes it not only as a displaced<sup>iii</sup> quest romance with picaresque and pastoral mode, but also as the first-person narration of a journey which can be read for its pleasure, aesthetic merits, and useful information (Thompson, 2011). In the words of Tszervan Todorov, travel writing "recounts the discovery of others, either savagery of faraway lands or the representations of non-European civilization" (as cited in Calzati, 2015, p.424). Unlike Fussell, Campbell, and Todorov, to define travel writing, Lisle (2007) places it between novels and guidebooks, and contends that it is inferior to novels in terms of imagination, while superior to guide books in the view of its literary merits. In commensurate with other literary genres, travel writing does not come into existence in a vacuum, it indebts its birth to "the travel tales of figures such as Isis, Gilgamesh, and Herakles" (Hutton, 2016, p.101). Simson speculates that the earliest travel narratives are written in Egypt, and *The Story of Sinuhe* is the best example; in this work Sinhue narrates his exile to Levant where he marries the ruler's daughter and gets rich, but he returns back to his homeland in his old age when he receives an invitation from a new pharaoh (ibid.). Besides ancient Egyptians, the Arab, the Persian, the Chinese, and the Indian had their own travel narratives before the emergence of early modern period. According to al-Suwaydi, "travelogues constitute one of the oldest genres in the Arabic literary legacy (as cited in Matar, 2016, p.139). Most of travelogues in this era were written by Sunni Muslims who "felt a keen sense of difference from the *Rafida* (non-Sunni) [by travel writers like] Ibn Jubayr and Ibn Battuta" (p.140). The first travelogue in Persian language was written by Nasir Khosrow in 1034 when Persia was the part of the Empire of Islam (Fazeli, 2006). According to Matar (2003) the travel writer in question had a sharp eye and he faithfully described what he encountered and presented the picture of medieval Islamic world by striving to be empirical and avoiding hearsay. Travel literature which in Chinese language was known as *youji*, was considered as an informal type of writing (Hargett, 2016). According to Xiaolun (2006) "it was an outgrowth of historiography and landscape poetry" (p.223) and it was composed by scholar-officials (literati) who were connected to Chinese Empire (ibid.). The most important characteristic of this travel narrative was its frequent use of "cinematic-like word picture of places" (Hargett, 2016, p.113) In addition, this genre in China had its origin in "the Six Dynasties period (220-589)" (ibid.). In India, the accounts of travel did not appear separately in prose but it "existed in other forms such poetry and myth" (Bhattachaji, 2016, p.125). For example, "the Mahabharata and the Ramayana" (p.127) are not travelogues but they incorporate travel narratives. Travel writing in the West, according to Youngs (2013), dates back to Herodotus, whose *Histories*, written in the fifth century BCE... [recounts] the wars between the Persian Empire and the Greeks" (p.20). Barbara Korte remarks that Roman and Greek travel writing paved the way for the development of medieval and Early Modern travel writing. In the Middle Ages, there were two types of travel writing in Christian West: religious as well as secular-religious. The focus of the former was on pilgrimage. According to Bale (2016) "the most common genre of medieval text that best be called travel writing is *itinerarium* [which is] an itinerary of holy places and first-hand account of a pilgrimage" (2016, p.152). The best example of this *itinerarium* is the *Pilgrimage of Egeria* which is "a partially preserved epistolary record in Latin of a woman's journey to the biblical lands from her home in the far west of Europe" (Hutton, 2016, p.109). In her travelogue, she did not present ethnographical information about her traveled world since "in Christian dogma and culture, *curiositas*, that is curiosity about the world, is a sin, related to the Original Sin and the Transgression, hence identified with humanity's Fall" (Melman, 2002, p.108). Unlike the former travel writing, the focal point of the latter was Far East. This type of travel writing was inspired by four primary impulses; firstly to gather intelligence so that it could help the Christians either to combat their new foes (Mongols) or turn them into their alliance against Muslims; secondly, to collect information about Oriental places and peoples; thirdly, converting their travelers into Christianity in the case of friars, and finally supplying answers to following questions. 1). what should Western Christians [we] be? 2). How should they be? (Phillips, 2014). For example, travel books written by Rubruck, Odoric, and Marco Polo fall into this category (ibid). Contrary to previous era when travel writing was rife with the elements of fantasy (Gholi, 2016 a), from 1450-1750 travel writing "adopted more consistent form and style, and a more empirical and scientific approach inspired by the Royal Society and Enlightenment" (Day, 2016, p.170); and as a result, it primarily concentrated on relaying information about external world rather than exploring or conveying the inner world of the travel writers (ibid.) and "Thomas Harriott's *A Brief and True Report of the New Found Land of Virginia*, for example, illustrates this drastic epistemological shift in travel writing" (Gholi, 2016, a, p.87). In the eighteenth century travel writing was enmeshed with Grand Tour. This travel institution was the privilege of English aristocrats' children. These young aristocrats "visited continental Europe...[for the sake of] furthering their education, observing foreign courts, learning modern languages, viewing monuments of classical antiquity" (Bohls, et al, 2005,

p.3). In sharp contrast to previous era, travel narrative in the eighteenth placed emphasis on “the subjectivity, discourses of taste and sentiment and accounts of ‘manners and morals’ over classical learning” (ibid.) thanks to “the new cultural valorization of sensibility<sup>iv</sup>, sensation, and feeling ...in 1768)” (Korte, 2016, p.179). Laurence Sterne’s *A Sentimental Journey through France and Italy* illustrates the change in question because in which the novelist depicts the world “through the radical subjectivity of a quirky sentimental traveler” (C.W. Thompson, 2012, pp.7-8). In Romantic period, travel writing was very popular among Romantic (in particular French) authors; this popularity can be explained by freedom which this genres grants to them due to its in-between status (C.W. Thompson, 2016). Romantic travel writing is characterized by digressing, changing theme and tone, incorporating dream, fantasy, poetry and satire, focalizing fragmentary impression to highlight subjectivity, as well as embracing the quests for unknown cultures and arts in elsewhere (2016). In English literature William Beckford’s *Dream, Waking Thoughts and Incidents* demonstrates aforementioned features. Travel writing in the Victorian period showcased its Imperialistic affiliation. Western travel writers especially British travel writers utilized it as an instrument to reinforce their superiority, fashion their selves (Moran, 2006). This explains why the alter-space like the East was constructed as “unrestrained, sensual, infantile, and barbaric” (p.110). Furthermore, travel writers like David Livingstone in his *Missionary Travels and Researches in South Africa* deployed this genre to portray their travelers in the sore need of three Cs: Culture, Christianity, and Commerce (Youngs, 2013) to justify their colonization and exploitation of supposedly primitive zones. In twentieth century similar to modernist novels, travelogues like *Road to Oxiana* by Robert Byron and *Eimi* by E.E. Cummings exhibit the features of modernist literature which include a fractured perspective to illustrate the difficulty of apprehending the complicated world, fragmentation to embody the breakdown of cultural wholeness and deterioration of modern life, stream of consciousness to reveal textually the unconscious mind, as well as blurring generic borders (Farley, 2016). For instance, E. E. Cummings in his *Eimi* which describes his travel to the Soviet Union breaks the syntax and words “to reflect and represent not only the subjective experience of the travel but also the impenetrable façade of soviet life” (p.280). Another important development in travel writing is the emergence of postcolonial travel writing. This type of travel writing is written by travel writers from former colonized countries, yet living in Western countries like V.S. Naipaul and Kincaid. According to Carl Thompson, these travelogues are distinguished by being alert to “past, present, instances of cross-cultural exchange, hybridization and transculturation, thereby countering the genre’s traditional emphasis on establishing the demarcations between cultures” (p.211). Moreover, travel writing is influenced by postmodern sensibility as well. In postmodern travelogues, travel writers show “tendency to playfulness and parody... a desire to subvert both the conventions and the authority traditionally associated with many Western genres, disciplines and discourses” (Thompson, 2011, p.126). A striking example is Bruce Chatwin’s *In Patagonia* and *Songlines* (ibid.). With regard to travel writing in the twenty first century, some pessimist travel writers like Jan Morris thinks that this genre is “cheapened and weakened in these times of universal travel and almost universal literary ambition” (as cited in Youngs, 2013, p.177). However, some think that production of travel writing will not lose its readership thanks to “the proliferation of blogs and increases of self-publishing” (ibid.). In addition, travel writing in this era has positively responded to Nature and ecological issues due to “the loss of habitats and species, global warming and the future of the planet” (p.184), and this explains why travelogue in the form of nature writing is growing in popularity. Finally besides nature writing, ‘footsteps’ genre, another offshoot of travel writing in which a travel writer records and “retraces the journeys of earlier travel writers” is becoming popular (Keirstead, 2013, p.285). This genre is characterized by “deep immersion in the discursive and personal space of the subjects...and holds unique capacity to undermine the still-powerful cultural myth of the self-sustaining, solitary traveler” (ibid.).

### 1.2 Travel Writer and his Travelogue

An anthropologist, a chief museum curator, and an Orientalist, Jurgen Wasim Frembgen (1955) has been deeply interested in South Asian cultures in particular that of Pakistan since his childhood. He opts it for his ethnographical investigation because he thinks that Pakistan “is the meeting place of cultures and it offers everything researcher wants ...and in many ways still unknown, as compared to other parts of the world” ( Frembgen, 2006, p.3). The roots of his inspiration and fascination in the South Asian cultures lie in his aunt “who embraced Islam and married a Pukhtun Popalzai from Afghanistan and traveled across the world” (ibid.).With regard to his anthropological field work in Pakistan, initially he concentrates his research in Nager located in the Karakorams<sup>v</sup>; then in different regions of Pakistan such as Punjab, Sindh, Hunza, and Indus Kohistan (ibid.). He publishes the outcome of his ethnographical investigation in the following books: *At the Shrine of the Red Sufi: Five Days and Nights Pilgrimage in Pakistan* (2012), *Journey to God and Dervishes in Islam* (2009), *The Friends of God-Sufi Saints in Islam: Popular Poster Art from Pakistan* (2012), *Nocturnal Music in the Land of the Sufis; The Unheard Pakistan* (2012), and *Wrestler, Pigeon Fanciers, and Kite Flyers: Traditional Sports and Pastimes in Lahore* (2014). Besides these books, he writes a literary travelogue too. This travelogue in fact is the “collection of fargments from his dairy” (Frembgen, 2014, p.114). It accounts his five times short journey to Harban valley located in the north of Pakistan. This tribal and cloistered region was historically stigmatized as a dangerous zone with fierce inhabitants in the nineteenth century by British colonizers. In the eyes of many anthropologists, this region has been somehow terra incognita which needs to be penetrated and explored anthropologically to unveil its mysteries. Encouraged by his professor, impelled by his own curiosity, hopeful to experience “epiphanic moments in which he might discover pristine truths of faith and human existence” (Lyon, 2016, p.254), and bored with his stultifying work condition in the museum, Frembgen determines to make a journey to the region in question even though he is well-aware that some anthropologist have failed to perform their anthropological projects due to Harbani residents’ hostility towards foreigners. His travel to this mountainous territory materializes when he obtains a letter of introduction from the local judge originally belongs to the area in question. In the letter, the

judge ensures that Frembgen, a newly converted Muslim, is traveling there for the sake of knowledge and does not have any ulterior motives. He also requests some influential local men to look after and assist him in his [ethnographic] research. When he reaches his destination, he is dubious whether his travel companions will accept him or mistrust him as a spy. To his relief, Maulavi<sup>vi</sup> Neeknam welcomes and hosts him for some days. He moreover permits him to make an excursion with his grandson in the fortified village that has been forbidden to the foreigners until that time. Besides the local priest, Frembgen benefits the hospitality of Shir Ghazi, another influential local man. His host's assistance and support enabled him to make forays into the region, to take pictures from local arts, crafts, architecture, its residents, and watchtowers, as well as to experience true culture of the region firsthand when he joins a group of young local lads during their party when they momentarily disregard Islamic religious commands. In his travelogue, Frembgen dwells on the region's caste system, its inhabitants' conflicts and passions, the spread of Islamic missionary known as Tablighi Jamaat, deforestation, honor killing, blood feuds, the status of local women, as well as his visit to enraptured fools. Regarding its literary merits, it is lucid and lyrical. Frembgen's travelogue emerges from the marriage between two opposing agendas: enlightenment and romantic (Gholi, 2016, b). The former strives to present its audience with information about the customs and practices of people living in his destination, and this aspect finds its full expression as the travel writer attempts "to capture the uniqueness and nuances of [his travel companions'] material culture" (p.86). While the latter seeks to unravel the traveler's inner world and it materializes when the travel writer confesses his quest for self-discovery and his dissatisfaction with his profession and work place.

## 2. Review of Literature

Frembgen's travelogue has not received enough attention from the scholars of travel writing since its publication by Oxford press in 2014 even though it is written in a literary style. The only published article about this travelogue is Gholi's (2016) *Dissection of Sympathy in Jurgen Frembgen's Travelogue: The Closed Valley: With Fierce Friends in Pakistani Himalayas*. In his article, Gholi illustrates the travel writer's sympathy towards nature, women, and enraptured fool called *Majzoob Baba*. To do so, he capitalizes on feminism to highlight the plight of his female travel companions, ecocriticism not only to heighten his readers' attention towards deforestation taking place in his traveled zone, but also to criticize his host for his role in excessive logging. In addition, he draws on Romanticism to demonstrate how the travel writer extends his sympathy towards the enraptured fool who was marginalized in the society for being different from the others similar to Romantic poets (like Wordsworth) who sympathize with the common and outcast. Nevertheless, Gholi does not pay attention to Orientalist dimension of the travelogue even though the travel writer replicates many orientalist tropes and images which were common in previous eras. Accordingly, to redress this shortcoming, the present article seeks to demonstrate how the travel writer in his representation of his travel companions and traveled world reiterates previous Western travelers' fallacies.

## 3. Methodology

Thanks to decolonization, deconstructionism, and Edward Said's *Orientalism*, hitherto neglected travel writing has elicited academic responses from the scholars of travel writing since 1970s (Calzati, 2015). In the eyes of these scholars, travel writing is not an innocent and objective description of what a traveler encounters during his/her journeys in a traversed terrain (Satapathy, 2012) because the genre is political not only for being enmeshed in "the projects of orientalism, colonialism, imperialism, and post-colonialism" (Moroz et al, as cited in Calzati, p. 423), but also for embedding "a hegemonic gaze directed towards the other-that is towards those peripheral people peoples who were invariably silence" (ibid.). This explains why Thompson (2016) demands it to be interrogated. It can be done by analyzing the representation of the traversed destination and travel companions via viewing the travelogue through a postcolonial lens. This approach rejects the neutral representation of the travel companions and travelled world by travel writers (Thompson, 2011, & Youngs, 2013, & Gholi, 2016) due to two reasons. Firstly, travel writers represent their travel companions and traveled zones on the basis of what Topping (2016) calls 'habitus' and 'field'. The former refers to unconsciously internalized system of disposition, and the latter to codified and institutional systems on their basis the travel writers operate. In other words, the travel writers do not represent "in a direct and sense-perception" (p.78), instead their representation is colored by their 'field' and 'habitus' which in turn are "informed by political, economic, and class affiliations" (ibid.). For Thompson (2011), this is ideological dimension of travel writing, thereby the reason behind not only (Western) travel writers' tendency to "depict other groups and cultures in a hostile or condescending way" (p.134), but also their persistence use of "stereotypes and unquestioned assumptions" (ibid.). For example, Edward Said in his *Orientalism* (1979) illustrates these cliché images and motifs about the Orient. Secondly, the representation is a rhetorical effect, albeit to some extent (Thomson, 2011), that is the travel writers use fictional devices such as synecdoche, exaggeration, metaphors, and other tropes to represent the alien terrain and its residents (Lisle, 2006), and this undercuts the factuality of the genre. This explains why Holland and Huggan (1998) by borrowing Hayden White labels the genre as the fiction of factual representation. Similarly Edward Said (1979) to demonstrate the rhetoricality of the truth-claim of representation of travel writing inserts a quotation from Nietzsche in which he attacks truth delivered by language, "a mobile army of metaphors, metonyms, and anthropomorphisms-in short, a sum of human relations, which have been enhanced, transposed, and embellished poetically and rhetorically... Truth are illusions about which one has forgotten that this is what they are" (p.203). To sum up, the depiction of the alter spaces and alien travel companions from the perspective of postcolonial scholars are ideological, rhetorical, and constructed, as a result unreliable and questionable.

## 4. Textual Analysis

### 4.1 Representation of Oriental Female Travelers

"Is this Lady or a Moor? Her dress and silence make us think that she is what we hope she is not"<sup>vii</sup>.

One of the crucial issues which Western travel writers have dwelt on it in their travelogues about the Orient is their female travelers. According to Andreeva (2010) “the theme of women is...significant since women are symbolizing the Orient” (p.157). By the same token, Stamm observes that “the idea of the Orient as a site of sensuality, beauty, and mystery becomes fully condensed in the figure of the Oriental women” (as cited in Brisson, 2013, p. 98). In the view of the portrayal of Oriental women, the Western travelers are asymmetrically divided. Only a tiny minority of Western travel writers have presented a sympathetic depiction of their Oriental female travelers. For instance, according to Nabil Matar (1996), Western travelers in the Renaissance praised Oriental [Muslim] women for their “reticence, obedience, frugality, modest apparel and behavior” (p.61). Likewise, Lady Montagu, the wife of British diplomat in Turkey in the eighteenth century does not view the veil of Islamic women as the sign of their oppression. Instead, she regards it not only as a means for defying the male’s sexualized gaze but also as an opportunity for sexual adventures. She also highlights her female travelers’ better conditions in terms of their financial independence (Fay, 2001). In a similar vein, in the second half of eighteenth century, Carsten Niebuhr in his scientific expedition to Islamic Orient refutes the claim that the situation of the Muslim women is dark in their society. In contrast, he contends they are luckier than their Christian counterparts due to exercising authority over their husbands in domestic affairs thanks to their private properties over which their husbands do not have any right (Mikkelsen, 2015). Unlike the first group, many Western travel writers have described the Oriental female in unfavorable terms. According to Menon (2003) the Oriental woman in Western travel literature is the embodiment of an “archetypal other” (p.103), and lasciviousness is her characteristic feature. This explains why Varthema, the fifteenth century Italian traveler, remarks that Oriental Indian women “intend nothing but their lust, and think that if they die virgins, they shall never enter into paradise” (ibid.). Likewise, Yahya et al (2012) agree with the lascivious depiction of Oriental women and note that this feature makes the Oriental women appear “exotic and immoral” (p.783). Similarly, Edward Said (1979) points that the Oriental women symbolized by *Kuchuk Hanem*, an Egyptian courtesan, for a famous French traveler like Flaubert is the embodiment of “unbounded sexuality” (p.187). Equally, Andreeva states (2010) that the Western travel writers have depicted their veiled female travelers as sealed and secluded slaves whom their husbands deny any romantic affection and treat inhumanely. Last but not least, likewise Brisson (2013) in her article, *Discovering Scheherazade: Representations of Oriental Women in the Travel Writing of Nineteenth Century German Women* argues that the three female German travel writers revive stereotypical notions about their Turkish female observees since they translated their travelers’ veil as the emblem of their subjugation, their habit of going bath as the sign of immorality, and their presence in the harems as that of captivity.

Similar to second group, Frembgen in his travel to Harban fails to debunk the stereotypical images of the Oriental female observees which have been weaved into the fabric of Western travel literature. Rather, he resuscitates them, and in line with the majority of Western travel writers, he portrays them as the victims of Islamic missionary group’s oppression and the misogynistic treatment of their romantically cold husband.

One of classic onslaughts which emerges in Western travel writing about Islamic Orient is the restriction of Oriental women by Islam (Andreeva, 2010). Similarly, the narrating persona of *The Closed Valley*, to demonstrate the negative impact of Islamic mentality and practice on Harbani women, capitalizes on the comparison drawn by Sher Ghazi, his host, about Harbani women’s social status before and after the arrival of the Islamic missionary group. According to his host, prior to the appearance of Tablighi Jamaat/Islamic missionary group in their village, the Harbani women not only enjoyed expressing their ideas but also discussed their problems together like men in the center of their village near to a small square without being interrupted and interfered by the men. But when the Islamic missionary group arrived their village in 1960s, their social freedom reached to its nadir since “Tablighi Movement had forbidden the women to meet [in the center of the village], asserting that women only sat around chatting in public and this was unseemly” (Frembgen, 2014, p.49). Thus by deploying this contrast in his narrative, the travel writer substantiates and reiterates the old Orientalist claim that Islam is “was innately and immutably oppressive to [Oriental Muslim] women” (as cited in Kahf, 1999, p.1) and responsible for trampling their right and paving the way for their further seclusion in the society (Marandi & Tari, 2012) even though his host is relating it, but it the is travel writer who selects, arranges, and controls the narration in his travelogue.

In addition to supposedly imposed confinement of Oriental women by Islam, another prevailing topos about the Oriental female travelers in Western travel writing is the image of the Oriental demonic husband who ill-treats his wife and denies her mutual romantic relationship. For example, Cherniaev, a Russian travel writer, claims that,

A Muslim woman ...has to endure all oppression patiently without murmur, and endure any circumstances, even if she becomes a victim of the most unbridled cruelty, has no right to complain to anybody and cannot look for protection from anyone... Under existing condition, it is impossible [to enjoy] family happiness based on [romantic] mutual love (as cited in Andreeva, 2010, p.167).

Like Cherniaev, Frembgen accentuates his female travelers’ plight by representing them chafing under their husbands who normally beat them and do not satisfy them emotionally and sexually. This explains why he describes the Harbani women’s position in dismal terms: “for these women ...marriage...is hell. If she is... beaten by her husband, she cannot go to a doctor. Where could she flee...the misery of the women is all apparent here” (Frembgen, 2014, p.106). Moreover, since an enthusiastic anthropologist by profession, the travel writer becomes curious about Harbani women whether they enjoy the pleasure of romantic liaison or their relationship is soulless and frigid. Later through local people’s snatches of conversations, he discovers that the Harbani women are deprived from life-giving intercourse and

conversation with their husbands because their husband “hardly exchange words with them. Intimacy and trust would be interpreted as weakness, as a lack of independent masculinity. A man is not supposed to express his affection for his wife” (p. 107). In this fragment, one can perceive that his female travelers are presented the victims of their patriarchal societies. Yet the authenticity of this claim is suspect since his judgment is based on hearsay and the snatches of conversation, and the travel writer himself has not seen their cold relationship firsthand because he does not have any access to their female travelers’ space or he has not interviewed with his female travelers to authenticate his judgment.

#### 4.2 Representation of Harban as the Locus of Danger and Violence

One of key subjects in the studies of travel writing is ‘space’ since it “is a central feature of all travel” (Lisle, 2006, p.138). According to Syed Islam (1996) space in its primordial state was “provisionary, multiple, and microcosmic” (p.21), that is to say, without any rigid boundaries. Nevertheless, later it became homogenous and geometric, resulting in the emergence of rigid geographical borders (ibid.). He also argues that the ontology and poetics of space has its roots in the views of philosophers such as Hippocrates for assigning space “the key to cultural difference” (p.6), Herodotus for upholding “the truth of spatial determination [like]...soft countries bred...soft men” (ibid.), Aristotle for justifying “the logic of difference” on the basis of “geographical location” (ibid), as well as Hegel for espousing the idea that “natural type of locality [is] intimately connected with the type and character of people” (ibid.). Taking her inspiration from Syed Islam, Lisle (2006) maintains that “desire to control space through accurate measurement ... [was] fulfilled in Enlightenment practice of cartography” (p.138). From her vantage point, cartography as “textualizing the spatial reality of the other” (Ashcroft et al., 2007, p.28) is not objective and accurate but it is ‘discursive’ and ‘imaginative’ and ‘ideological’ because it is “bolstered by already circulation of myths, messages, and meaning about the world” (Lisle, p.138). This poststructuralist interpretation of space is close to what Said calls ‘imaginative geography’ whereby he means “those forms of suppositional knowledge that are used to distinguish one social/cultural group from another by associating putatively intractable differences of mentality with unexamined perception of bounded territory [space]” (Huggan, 2015, p. 333). Chloe Chard (1999) points to the relationship between travel and imaginative geography and observes that travel writing has served as the most powerful device for perpetuating imaginative geography. Said’s imaginative geography is equivalent to Lisle’s “discourse of modern cartography” (2006, 137). Both terms operate on the basis of binary logic by reinforcing the “distinctions between here and there...between a safe, civilized home and a dangerous, and uncivilized elsewhere (ibid.). In this way, Orient is depicted as a dangerous site and Orientals as brutal in Western travelogues (Fleming, 2014; Lisle, 2006; Behdad, 2009), and Indus valley is not exception to this rule. According to Shafqat Hussein (2006) when the inhabitants of Indus Valley were “featured in colonial travel literature” (p.236), they were represented not only as caravan raiders but also “as uncivilized savages and wild looking men” (ibid.). In addition, their “region in general was referred to as *Yaghistan* meaning land of the ungovernable, of savages” (ibid). This negative portrayal of them by the English travel writers from Hussein’s perspective was done for “extending colonial...administrative control” (ibid.). In alignment with previous Western sedentary travel writers, to deploy Syed Islam’s term, in their venture to the Orient, Frembgen reproduces the discourse of modern cartography via recycling and reinforcing the image of Harban as the zone of barbarity and violence. Even though at the outset he “mistrusted on principle the common clichés and stereotypes which stigmatized the Kohistani<sup>viii</sup> on all sides” (Frembgen, 2014, p.5), and denounced the British colonial power for “vilifying them as lawless” (ibid.) and labeling the region as a “death camp” (p.2) solely for the sake of her “legitimization of colonial rule” (p.7), later he substantiated all the clichés weaved around Harban, “while I did not find the stereotypical image of the bloodthirsty Kohistani confirmed when I visited them, I must admit that that violent conflicts ...practically are order of the day” (p.103). These violent clashes in Harban are indicated by watchtowers which are normally built to serve as a refuge for those engaged in the fights and the travel writers affirms that their number has increased every time he returned there. From his travelogue, it can be inferred that the travel writer attributes the root cause of these battles mainly to the sense of honor as well as Islam.

To highlight the key role of honor in the prevalence of violence in the region, the travel writer chooses the feuds related to honor, since he believes that they are the most common ones in Harban, and thus they can unravel this mystery: Why the “half of all adult men in the valley have entrenched themselves in their houses and fortified towers?” (p. 101). In fact, concentrating on these feuds provides strong grounds for the travel writer to demarcate Oriental Harban from West and essentialize violence in Harban, and the following fragment attests to his Orientalist tendency: “atavistic feelings of revenge for affronts and breaches of honor seem to be [still] deeply rooted in [Harbani] people” (p.103), while in the West these feelings existed just during Feudalism, and this why there “anyone who talks about honor today is looked at askance (ibid).

From the travel writer’s perspective, honor which is intermingled by the “fragile masculinity” and “defined primarily through [their] mother, sister, wife, and daughter” (p.105) is the source of these unending cycle of feuds because it “obliges a man to risk his life to protect the family’s honor [otherwise] life would only mean derision and humiliation” (ibid.). By way of illustration, the travel writer accounts how in Harban a local man kills with axe his best friend in the forest when he discovers that his wife has established a romantic relationship with him, which in return, triggers a fierce blood feud between the clan of the husband and the dead lover. To give another example, the travel writer relates how a local Harbani bridegroom brutally murders his bride in the nuptial night when he realizes that she is attempting to flee from his house. His act, according to the travel writer, originates from his sense of honor because his bride’s escape in the context of Harban is tantamount to spoiling his sense of honor and the cause of humiliation both for him and his clan members and this why the travel expresses his happiness for not being born in Haran because he thinks that “men has virtually no alternatives [than restoring his honor through violence]” (p.108). His joy here demarcates the line

between safe West and hostile Orient and validate Orientalist claim that hostility is institutionalized in Oriental space like Harban and Harbanis. By doing so, he reveals his dependence and his inescapability from calls Said calls imaginative geography in his representation of the Oriental travelles.

Moreover, the travel writer arrogates himself the Orientalist privilege of judgment and accuses Islam for the occurrence of the feuds in Harban Valley. He assumes that the strict rules which imposed on Muslim Harbani by Islam along with the puritanism of Tablighi Movement have stifled passion and freedom in their lives. As a consequence, to experience pure love and intimacy, they embrace extramarital affairs which results in new series of feuds among clans,

Against this background, the willingness to become involved in dangerous extramarital relationships seems to a reaction to the strict set of rules of Islam, with its rigid separation of the sexes, moral teachings, domestications of the body and control over sexuality. Thus, individuals burst these chains and dash to freedom which usually ends in disaster ...Love affairs open up spaces for intense feelings in which women flee from the harsh limitations ...and men their rebellion, courage, and boldness (p.104).

The above extract reminds back Norma Khouri's travel memoir, *Forbidden Love* (2003) in which the travel writer similar to Frembgen ascribes the murder of Dalia, a Jordanian women, due to having an illicit romantic relation with a Christian officer to Islamic mentality in Jordan which in the view of Huggan (2012) is kind of regurgitating an orientalist fallacy done to pander the moral superiority of Western readers.

Besides two aforementioned reasons, in Harban which the travel writer sketches for his allegedly civilized readers, safety and security is inconceivable because "feuds remain an omnipresent threat" (p.107). Thus it is not unusual that "repeatedly innocent bystanders are killed" (ibid.) for being suddenly caught in the crossfire of people involved in the feuds and die by bullets coming different directions.

Finally, to fortify and recycle the discourse of modern cartography based on polarity between here/West as safe and secure and there/Orient as hostile and volatile, the travel writer resorts to the photos of not only the fortified towers functioning as a synecdoche of violence, but also the young and old travelles holding gun to convince his readers that the situation is so dangerous that carrying a gun to survive is essential.



<sup>18</sup>Fig. 1



Fig. 2



Fig. 3



Fig. 4

According to Youngs (2006), photographs have been "an important feature of many travel books" (p.11). In the viewpoints of Mary Louise Pratt and John Urry, photography is not an innocent and objective documentation of objects because it is constrained by "cultural codes, pictorial conventions, and photographer's purpose, motivation, and technical skills" (Koivunen, 2009, p.34). Instead they regard it as a type of appropriation of photographed objects and an accomplice of imperialism (Youngs, 2011, p.11). For instance, Susan Sontag notes that the camera is "predatory and to photograph people is to violate them, by seeing them as they never see themselves, by having knowledge of them they can never have, it turns people into objects that can be symbolically possessed" (as cited in Topping, 2016, p.81). Confirming Youngs, Schwartz (1996) holds that photography is interconnected to travel writing and has been influential in perpetuating imaginative geographies. Thus these pictures are not a window to reality but the reiteration of the discourse of Orientalist attitude of the travel writer that is his Oriental destination is violent and its residents are dangerous beings.

### 4.3 Representation of Harban as a Timeless Zone

One of common fallacies both in anthropology and travel writing, from the perspective of Johannes Fabian, is ‘denial of coevalness’ (Lisle, 2006), that is, both travel writers and anthropologists consign their travelees or anthropological referents “in a time other than Western present” (Behdad, 1994, p.6) despite sharing time with them. To put it differently, the Western travel writers and anthropologists portray their observees “as living fossils... to a greater or lesser degree survivals from an earlier epoch” (Thompson, 2011, p. 147) by exploiting temporal adjectives such as primitive, backward, developing, medieval, feudal, tribal, underdeveloped, and traditional (Mills, 1999 & conquergood, 1999). Fabian’s denial of coevalness is equivalent to what Said calls ‘pragmatic fossilization’, that is, “to discursively construct [the Orient/travel destination] as static and timeless identity” (as cited in Tavares & Brosseau, 2006). Accordingly, from Said’s view, when as Western travel writer or traveler makes a journey to the Orient, he is not just moving in space from one location to another, he is potentially traveling back in time (McLeod, 2000) because “the very possibility of development, transformation, human movement-in the deepest sense of the word-is denied to the Orient and the Oriental” (Said, 1979, p.208).

As an Orientalist, anthropologist, and travel writer, Frembgen like many Western travel writers and anthropologists before him, he fails to dislodge the entrenched paradigm of ‘denial of coevalness’ or –‘changeless Orient’ in his travelogue. Instead, he revives it in different ways. Firstly by branding his travel destination and its residents as archaic when he for the first time manages to penetrate into there,

Once, I pause for breath to tie my shoelace and sneak a look at my surroundings. The whole appearance of the Harban *koot* [fortified village] is breathtakingly archaic-the faces of the Kohistani, the construction of their houses and the wooden carvings, [and even] the odor from their cattle sheds and dung piles (Frembgen, 2014, p.21).

In above passage, the description of the observees’ appearance and their old houses decorated with intricate wood carvings, and even smell wafting from their cattle sheds generate an impression in the travel writer under which he assumes that the Oriental Harban and its inhabitants have remained unchanged even though they are living in the second half of the twentieth century. In this way, the travel writer textually places them back in the queue of time, to use Lisle’s phrase. Moreover, the travel writer capitalizes on two visual images to articulate temporal stasis in his remote traversed world. Ballerini demonstrates the role of photography in promoting the Orientalist discourse (Behdad & Gartlan, 2013) in a sense that photography “cements a partial vision of the culture visited as fixed and unchanging” (Topping, 2016, p.82).



<sup>x</sup> Fig. 5



Fig.6

Back to the photos. In the first photo, through a close-up shot, the travel writer focuses not only on his observees’ simple and unadorned looks but also on his hand-made wool cap and his daughter’s traditional, supposedly exotic, and cone-like head-gear bedecked with colored glass beads and buttons, and topped with tassels. By so doing, he implies that his travelees are authentic and they have retained the aura of bygone times via resisting “modernity [the relentless rush of globalization] that makes everything uniform” (Anzaldúa, as cited in Hawthorne, 1989, p.621) and shrinks the world into a small village. In the second picture, through a medium shot, he places the emphasis equally on the little Harbani boy’s local costume an emblematic of his pure Oriental identity and ethnicity as well as the traditional houses of Harban. According to Clifford Geertz, architecture (here simple houses in Harban) is an expression of “people’s ethos” whereby he means “the tone, character, quality of their life, world view, its morals, and aesthetic style and mood” (as cited in Zarrinjooee, 2014, p.160). Therefore, when the travel writer claims that their houses are archaic, in fact he suggests that they remained unchanged both in their overall demeanors (ethos) and their art of house making (architecture). Thus it will not be erroneous to draw a conclusion that the local residents have constructed their houses by utilizing same simple construction materials such as stone, mud, and timber which their ancestors had done in previous eras.

Secondly, the travel writer displays the anachronism of his traveled world by likening it to Arabian Nights and the pictures of Pieter Bruegel the Elder. Wazzan (1993) notes that *Arabian Nights* with its exotic settings and magical stories has been influential in motivating the Westerners to travel to the Orient. Thus it is not odd for the Western travelers to be hopeful to find and experience the enchanting atmosphere of *Arabian Nights* in their voyages (Mills, 1991). Citing Kate Teltscher, Khair (2016) notes that one of prevailing tropes in travel books about South Asia is viewing the region as the “land of Arabian exoticism” (p.384). This explains why Frembgen compares his obtained introduction letter from an influential judge in Chilas, a city in Pakistan, to an *open sesame* and his opportunity of entering into Harban to the tale of *Ali Baba and Forty Thieves*: “like the tale of *Ali Baba and the Forty Thieves*, the cave door [Harban] to the treasure [Oriental mysteries in Harban] appears to open as if by magic [the letter functioning as *open sesame*]” (Frembgen, 2014, p.22). The travel writer in addition manifests ‘denial coevalness’ when he equates the landscape of Harban to the paintings of the sixteenth century Flemish Pieter Bruegel Elder who according to Britannica is well-known for his landscape paintings and European peasants’ life, “densely-packed houses of the fortified village, the smoke rising from fires, and figures turning a corner here and there, sometimes stopping, somewhat baffled my presence, remind me ...of lively scenes in paintings by Pieter Bruegel the Elder” (p. 47).

Finally, to incarcerate Harban in time the travel writer poises it against his own advanced country, “I consider it a privilege to be able to still experience some of the original atmosphere of the almost medieval village before I return to its virtual opposite in Germany with its complex, hypermodern life worlds” (p.46). In this fragment, on the surface it seems that the travel writer is criticizing complex, artificial and hypermodern life in Germany, and placing Harban on a pedestal for bearing resemblance to the romantic ‘rustic past’ to borrow Kaplan’s words,

[In Harban] one hears cackling hens, quacking ducks, bleating sheep and goats, and whinnying horse, mewing cats...A farmer is chopping wood while another is sawing. From far away echoes the plaintive hee-haw of a donkey. Out of fields rises the humming, buzzing, and chirping of insects. Trees rustle in the light wind...sounds of nature...what a contrast to the noise of pollution ...in else where most sounds are artificially produced (Frembgen, 2014, p.41)

But on the closer inspection, one realizes he is replicating the orientalist’s claim that the Orient is “immobile and fixed for good and all [despite] ... despite undergoing constant changes ...through transformation” (Kapuscinski, 2008, p.33) in particular when he pictures Harban as a ‘medieval village’ in the first fragment.

#### 4.4 Representation of Harban as an Object of Curiosity in Demand of Textual Salvage

*They cannot represent themselves; they must be represented.*

*Karl Marx*

Non-Western people (including Orientals) and their cultures have been an object of curiosity and exploration for Westerners since the time of Herodotus, a Greek historian cum traveler and Cicero, a Roman philosopher. However, their curiosity was not innocent because the Western scientists, philosophers, and travelers from classical eras until the Middle Ages had portrayed their non-Western observees in negative terms: as exotics, uncivilized barbarians or monstrous subhumans on account of their cultural baggage and lack of a rigorous methodology to distinguish fact from fiction (Stevenson, 2010 & Kapuscinsky, 2008). In a marked epistemological transformation during the Enlightenment in the eighteenth century, Western enquiry and exploration about the others and their cultures equipped itself with empiricism and sought to not only avoid the pitfalls of previous periods, but also sift fantasy out from fact via utilizing scientific approaches devised by philosophers like Francis Bacon and John Locke (Cooke, 2016). In the nineteenth century, this investigation and curiosity about the mores and manners of the others living in supposedly exotic cultures in remote places became more systematic, and emerged as Anthropology, “science of human and culture phenomena” (Clifford, 1986, p.102). The burgeoning discourse was indebted its starting point and theoretical basis to Charles Darwin’s concept of evolution (cultural anthropology in Britannica). As a result, anthropology was a scientific discourse at the disposal of so-called civilized and advanced people (as self) to study allegedly savage and backward ones (as other). Given the reaction to the discipline, there are two groups. The first group looks at it in positive light and considers it as humanistic and credible approach to understand,

Each people as far as possible in their own terms, to try to grapple with both similarities and differences among peoples, to understand nature of human behavior and diversity...to know about ways of the ways of adapting to different types of environments, and grasp the implications of different types of environments, the range of possible family and kinship and political and economic systems, beliefs... [and] to record for posterity the lives, thoughts, works, arts, languages, and struggles of all the world’s peoples (Lewis, 2007, p.778).

Whereas the second group which belongs to a poststructuralist camp condemns it for being an accomplice of colonialism, exploiting disempowered others in their fieldworks, controlling them in panopticon fashion by means of its participant-observation, and eroticizing (ibid. p.779).

Anthropology is hybrid discipline by default, and it is interconnected to both travel writing and Orientalism. Metacalf observes (2005) that anthropology is an “outgrowth of travel literature” (p.1) because, according to Grgurinovic, “anthropological theory and gathering ethnographic data have long [been] depended on travelers... with whom they have shared the guidelines and queries for collection on ethnographical data” (2012, p.45). For Huggan (2015), the commonality of travel writing and anthropology lies in their being bounded by discourse. Looking from a structuralist

perspective, Thornton notes that the tropes of anthropology are similar to those of travelogues (Grgurinovic, 2012, p.46) although travelogues “proceed... narratively” while anthropological monographs “proceed... descriptively” (Stagl, et al, 2010, p.122). Anthropology can also become the kinship of orientalism when anthropologists choose the Orient as their fieldwork destination. Said (1979) is suspicious about the seemingly scientific and innocent activities in the Orient. He regards them as strategies for dominating the Orient, to prove his claim, he presents the example of Napoleon’s scientific mission which paved the way for the colonization of Egypt by France.

As an Orientalist, anthropologist, and travel writer, Frembgen chooses Oriental and allegedly less advanced and known Harban and its residents as the site of his exploration and curiosity; as the travel writer himself avers that he “came to Harban *fi talab al- ilm<sup>xi</sup>*- in the search of knowledge” (Frembgen, 2014, p.22). By doing so, he “locates himself as the powerful enunciating subject invested with authority to discourse about the other” (Behdad, 2009, p.86). In fact, Frembgen as the savant<sup>xii</sup> traveler is “the subject of knowledge and power” (p.88) who is trying to represent the culture of Harban (since its inhabitant as less developed people cannot represent themselves), whereas his travelees and their culture are “as the object of institutional investigation” (ibid.). He manifests his enunciating and representative power through what James Clifford calls ‘allegory of salvage’, that is to say, to redeem a culture and its signs through their textualization/writing before disappearing and disintegrating (Clifford, 1986). By way of illustration, when the savant travel writer was crossing a bridge, he detected several watermills grinding wheat and barley. At the same time, he saw a strange measuring vessel which got better of his curiosity, and thus he immediately started to measure its size and describe its shape,

Quantity [of flour] is measured by pouring the flour into a special measuring vessel. Made of walnut wood, it is fourteen centimeters high and ten centimeters in diameter. The mill owner surprised to see the eccentric foreigner turning, twisting, and measuring the vessel with a tape measure (Frembgen, 2014, p.42).

In the above fragment, the travel writer’s act of measuring the vessel and describing it in detail bespeaks his intention of salvaging this different way of measuring flour through his systematic and descriptive note-taking before its disappearing with the arrival of modern/Western one in this simple society. In addition to the measuring vessel, the travel writer was impatient and curious to visit Harbani craftsmen to gather information about their handicrafts. Therefore, with the help of his host, he could meet, a local weaver’s workplace where he made wool “caps, vests, coats, shepherds’ trousers, and blankets” (p.43). As an anthropologist/ orientalist he is not satisfied just by gazing at them because he deems his responsibility to rescue this ingenious craft from sinking into oblivion through his textualization (and visualization). To do so, he entered the court yard and found the loom in a shallow pit and began to, “make a sketch, take a picture, and make a note of the *Shina* terms for the various parts of the pit loom. Since there is no one else around, I also measure the planks, and pegs” (p.44). Finally, another item which awakened anthropological curiosity of the travel writer and impelled him like a cultural translator to domesticate its cultural complexity and translate into Western transcription to save it from forgetfulness, is “the end of the drawstring” (p.86) or “decorative trouser-cord” (p.87). It is normally decorated and kept hidden inside the trouser and needs to be tied tightly because if it is loose, it is the marker of immorality of its wearer. Since the item is purely an oriental art, the anthropologist/travel thinks that “it will be a wonderful collector’s item in [their] museums in Munich” (p.87). The notion that he is going to display and describe its feature in the museum reveals his desire to salvage it from being obsolete with the passage of time.

#### 4.5 Harban as the locus of Escape

*The great affairs is to move...to come off this feather-bed of civilization...Alas, as we get up in life, and are more preoccupied with our affairs, even a holiday is a thing that must be worked for.*

Robert Louise Stevenson

*Why don't people leave off being lovable,*

*Or thinking they are lovable, or wanting to be lovable,*

*And be a bit elemental instead?*

D. H. Lawrence

One of leitmotifs which has characterized Western travel writing is yearning to escape from home to the loci which are “elemental, noble, primitive or pagan” (Whitfield, 2011, 283). It goes without saying that this desire does not emerge in a vacuum; rather it, according to Freud, originates from a sense of unhappiness despite humans’ efforts to fend it off through psychological strategies such as voluntary isolation, intoxication, controlling and sublimating instincts, enjoyment of beauty, loving relationships, as well as illusion and delusion (Capps, et al, 2013). The reason behind this psychological malaise, Freud argues, lies in internal and external restrictions imposed on the libidinal desires of the subjects in the societies by civilization ( which refer to the structures of culture, law, and religion to name some) in order to reduce their unhappiness and ensure their security (Thurschwell, 2000). Sharing Freud’s speculation, Whitfield notes that Western people “have created a complex, pressurized, dehumanized society in which the need to escape has been endemic” (2011, p.282). Thus from Freud’s view point, the crucial motive behind undertaking a journey, is to run away from home/father,

My longing to travel was no doubt also the expression of a wish to escape from that pressure, like the force which drives so many adolescent children to run away from home. I had long seen clearly that a great part of pleasure of travel lies in the fulfilment of these early wishes-that is rooted ...in dissatisfaction with home and family [especially father]. When first one catches sight of the sea, crosses the ocean and experiences as realities cities and lands which for so long had been distant, unattainable things of desire-one feels oneself like a hero who has performed deeds of improbable greatness (as cited in Musgrove, 1999, p.32)

To travel with the intention of gratifying desires which denied at home is the most important characteristic of those travelers/travel writers whom Abrams (2009) calls as primitivists due to their,

Longing to escape from the complexities, fever, anxieties, and alienation of modern civilization into what are taken to be elemental simplicities of lost natural life. That imagined life may be identified with the individual's own childhood, or with the prehistoric or classical or medieval past, or may be conceived as existing still in some primitive, carefree, faraway place on earth (p.287).

According to Wilson, this tendency "goes back to Homer and Hesiod" (as cited in Kassis, 2015, p.14). There are many modern and contemporary travel writers whose travelogues are fueled by the trope of escape (Calzati, 2015). English travelogues written between the First and Second War in particular those of D.H. Lawrence clearly registers the tendency" (Fussell, 1980, p.15). According to Porter (1991), "among English writers, no one has expressed forcefully his discontent with the state of twentieth-century civilization going back to the Renaissance and beyond than D.H. Lawrence" (p.201). His travels, in fact, is the articulation of his desire to flee not only soulless mechanization and industrialization but also the desolation crated by World War One to ideal sites where he could experience rebirth and establish harmonious relationship with Nature, Travelees, and Self (Michelucci, 2004).

In accordance with the travel writers with Romantic agony, Frembgen evinces his dissatisfaction with Western civilization where, from his point of view, freedom is curtailed, blind obedience demanded, and hunger for power practiced with good faith (Frembgen, 2014, p.5). The source of his discontent stems from three factors. Firstly, from an academic life which is devoid of joys and vitality and rife with superfluous and unnecessary flaunt of intellectual capability and vaunted sophistication. Secondly, exhausting career in the museum, and thirdly, from living in superficial society in which people have huge hunger for attention,

Dissatisfied with working as an academic chained to his desk, with book-keeping mentality and constant activity in the museum, the sophisticated terminologies and categories used in discussion rounds in universities and altogether with living and working in a society so hungry for attention with its inflation of words and pictures (p.111).

To find solace to his psychological discontent, he chooses to set out on a journey to Harban, "a remote anarchic region" (p.2) in Himalaya, where he, for a one reason, is hopeful to find the anathema of the West, that is to say, "freedom from any kind of authority" (p.5) "lost authenticity... [and] an Arcadia" (p. 46) or "an asylum from an ailing and degenerate modern Western civilization" (Melman, 2002, p.115) since the regions beyond alleged civilization, Thompson (2011) observes, represent an escape from the vices of the civilization. Even through the travel writer portrays the region as an extremely dangerous zone, he contradictorily lays bare the romantic side of Harban (even though it proves fleeting) in particular when his narration concentrates on a group of young Harbanis whom he joins during his visit in August 1991. This explains why Kassis (2015) remarks that contradictions are embedded in travel writing. In a marked contrast to the travel writer, his travelees live in close to nature without any official obligations to inhibit their freedom and render them subservient because Harban like other "tribal societies [operates] without central authorities, official channels or a state" (p.2). By way of illustration, unlike the travel writer who bemoans the absence of vitality and freedom in his workplace and feels trapped by his profession in the museum, his young travelees "cannot [even] imagine what a House of Wonders [museum] is. None of them ever been to a large city, to say nothing of having ever visited a museum, they are no more interested in anthropology than birds in ornithology" (p.78). The notion that his travelees have not been in the city to visit a museum alludes to the point that they have not been affected by modern life; instead, they have been living innocently and freely in the lap of nature. In addition, in opposition to his colleagues who are sorely in the pursuit of worldly power and striving hard to hijack attention in their hypocritical society, his young travelees standing in synecdochical relation to all Harbanis, every morning go through the fields to pick fresh flowers for their caps because in his traveled world "Romantic enthusiasm for flowers is not just typical for this group of young men but is common in everyday life in Harban" (p.81). Finally, in contrast to the travel writer who is bored with sterile academic terminologies and phrases, pointing to the artificiality of his life, his travelees are not constrained by barren academic life, rather they "are closely linked to the nature of their region" indicated by their deep passion for hunting in the snow covered mountains of Himalaya.

## 5. Conclusion

The genre of travel writing from the view point of postcolonial scholars is not a mirror to reflect faithfully travelees and their zone. For them, it is embedded in politics (Lisle, 2007) and a powerful device for a dominant culture not only to fashion the image of other cultures (Bassnett, 2003) but also perpetuate cultural difference (Lisle) even though travel

writers deny this allegation. Thus in Western travel writing the Orient has been viewed from an ideological lens ('habits' and 'field') resulted in distorted (and even jaundiced) representation of the travelers and their culture. In this regard, Frembsgen in his travelogue, *The Closed Valley: With Fierce Friends in Pakistani Himalayas* Western represents Harban, his traveled terrain in a dialogue with previous Western travel writers; that is, instead of offering fresh and unorientalist image of the Orient, the travel writer similar to Western travel writers with their strong sense of cultural baggage, represents Harban as a timeless region fraught with tribal conflicts and feuds, yet it is a land to flee from the suffocating and dehumanizing atmosphere of the West. Furthermore, for him in this cloistered travel world, women are brutalized by their husbands and their very right of free speech is trampled by Muslim extremists. Lastly, Harban in the eye of the travel writer cum anthropologist is an object of curiosity, and its archaic crafts and customs are in the need of the salvage textually by him.

## References

- Abrams, M. (2009). *A Glossary of Literary Terms*. Boston: Wadsworth Cengage Learning.
- Ashcroft, B., Griffiths, G., & Tiffin, H. (2007). *Post-Colonial Studies: Key Concepts*. London & New York: Routledge.
- Bale, A. (2016). European Travel Writing in Middle Ages. In C. Thompson (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 152-160). New York & London: Routledge.
- Bassnett, S. (2003). The Empire, Travel Writing, and British Studies. In S. Monthy (Ed.), *Travel Writing and Empire* (pp. 1-21). New Delhi: Katha.
- Behdad, A. (1999). *Belated Travelers: Orientalism in the Age of Colonial Dissolution*. Durham & London: Duke University Press.
- Behdad, A. (2009). The Politics of Adventure: Theories of Travel, Discourse of Power. In J. Kuehn, & P. Smethurst (Eds.), *Travel Writing, Form, and Empire: The Poetics and Politics of Mobility* (pp. 80-94). New York & Oxon: Routledge.
- Behdad, A., & Gartlan, L. (Eds.). (2013). *Photography's Orientalism: New Essays on Colonial Representation*. Los Angeles: The Getty Research Institute.
- Bendixen, A. (2009). American Travel Book about Europe Before Civil War. In *The Cambridge Companion Guide to Travel Writing* (pp. 103-126). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bhattacharji. (2016). Indian Travel Writing. In Thompson (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 125-138). New York & London: Routledge.
- Blanton, C. (1997). *Travel Writing: Self and the World*. New York: Twayne.
- Bohls, J., & Duncan, I. (Eds.). (2005). *Travel Writing 1700-1830: An Anthology*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Borm, J. (2004). 'Defining Travel: On the Travel Book, Travel Writing and Terminology'. In G. Hooper, & T. Youngs (Eds.), *Perspectives on Travel Writing* (pp. 13-26). Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Brisson, U. (2013). Discovering Scheherazade: Representations of Oriental Women in the Travel Writing of Nineteenth Century German Women. *Women in German Yearbook*, 29, 99-117.
- Bruegel, Jan, *The Elder*. (2010). *Encyclopædia Britannica. Encyclopaedia Britannica Ultimate Reference Suite*. Chicago: Encyclopædia Britannica. (n.d.).
- Calzati, S. (2015). Traveling and Writing the Form of Travel Writing: Reconsidering Bill Bryson's (Supposed) Postcolonial Legacy. *Journal of Postcolonial Writing*, 51(4), 422-453.
- Capps, D., & Carlin, N. (2013). Human Chances for Happiness: A Review of Freud's Civilization and Its Discontents. *Pastoral Psychol*, 62, 271-289.
- Chard, C. (1999). *Pleasure and Guilt on the Grand Tour: Travel writing and Imaginative Geography 1600-1830*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Clifford, J. (1986). On Ethnographic Allegory. In J. Clifford, & G. Marcus (Eds.), *Writing Cultur: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography* (pp. 98-121). Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Conquergood, D. (1991). Rethinking Ethnography: Towards a Critical Cultural Politics. *Communication Monographs*, 58, 179-194.
- Cooke, S. (2016). Inner Journeys: Travel Writing as Life Writing. In C. Thompson (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 15-24). New York, Abingdon.
- Cultural Anthropology (2010). *Encyclopædia Britannica. Encyclopaedia Britannica Ultimate Reference Suite*. Chicago: Encyclopædia Britannica. (n.d.).
- Day, M. (2016). Western Travel Writing, 1450-1750. In *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 161-172). New York-London: Routledge.
- Farley, D. (2016). Modernist Travel Writing. In C. Thompson (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 278-287). New York & London: Routledge.

- Fay, M. (2001). Ottoman Women Through the Eyes of Mary Wortley Montagu. In P. Stakey, & J. Starkey (Eds.), *Unfolding the Orient: Travelers in Egypt and the East* (pp. 157-178). Lebanon: Ithaca Press.
- Fazeli. (2006). *Politics of Culture in Iran: Anthropology, Politics and Society in Iran*. New York & Abingdon: Routledge.
- Fleming, K. (2014). *The Muslim Bonaparte: Diplomacy and Orientalism in Ali Pasha's Greece*. Princeton, N. J.: Princeton University Press.
- Frembgen, J. (2014). *The Closed Valley: With Fierce Friends in the Pakistani Himalaya*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Frembgen, J. W. (2006, May 6). Interview: Prof Dr. Wasim Frembgen. (S. Akhtar, Interviewer)
- Gholi, A. (2016 a). Representation of Central Asia and Traveling Self in Vambery's Travels in Central Asia. *International Journal of English Language and Translation Studies*, 4(1), 85-101.
- Gholi, A. (2016 b). Dissection of Sympathy in Jurgen Frembgen's Travelogue: The Closed Valley: With Fierce Friends in Pakistani Himalaya. *International Journal of English Language and Translation Studies*, 4(2), 83-95.
- Gilroy, J. (2010). *Romantic Literature*. London : York Press.
- Grgurinvie, I. (2012). Anthropology and Travel: Practice and Text. *Stud, Ethnol, Croat*, 24, 45-60.
- Hargett, J. (2016). Chinese Travel Writing. In C. Thompson (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 112-124). New York-London: Routledge.
- Hawthorne, S. (1989). The Politics of the Exotic: The Paradox of Culture Voyeurism. *NWSA Journal*, 1(4), 617-629.
- Herbsmeier, M. (2010). Spontaneous Ethnographies: Towards a Social History of Travelers' Tales. *Studies in Travel Writing*, 1(1), 216-238.
- Holland, P., & Huggan, G. (1998). *Tourist With Typewriters: Critical Reflections on Contemporary Travel Writing*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.
- Huggan, G. (2009). *Extreme Pursuits: Travel Writing in the Age of Globalization*. The United States of America: Michigan University Press.
- Huggan, G. (2015). Anthropology/Travel/Writing/: Strange Encounters with James Clifford and Nicolas Rothwell. In J. Kueh, & P. Smethurst (Eds.), *New Directions in Travel Writing Studies* (pp. 228-245). New York & Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Hussain, S. (2006). Small Players in the Great Game: Marginality and Representation on the Northern Frontiers of Nineteenth Century Colonial India. *South Asia: Journal of South Asian Studies*, 24(2), 235-253.
- Hutton, W. (2016). Travel Writing in the Ancient Mediterranean. In C. Thompson (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 101-1011). New York & London: Routledge.
- Islam, S. (1996). *The Ethics of Travel: From Marco Polo to Kafka*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Kahf, M. (1999). *Western Representations of Muslim Women: From Termagant to Odalisque*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Kapuscinski, R. (2008). *The Other*. (A. Liloyd-Jones, Trans.) New York & London: Verso.
- Kassis, D. (2015). *Representation of the North in Victorian Travel Literature*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Keirstead, C. (2013). Convolutional Paths: Mapping Genre in Contemporary Footsteps Travel Writing. *Genre*, 46(13), 285-315.
- Khair, T. (2016). India/South Asia. In C. Thompson (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 384-393). New York and Abingdon: Routledge.
- Koivunen, L. (2009). *Visualizing Africa in Nineteenth-Century British Travel Account*. New York & Oxon: Taylor Francis.
- Korte, B. (2000). *English Travel Writing from Pilgrimages to Postcolonial Explorations*. (C. Matthias, Trans.) New York: Macmillan Press.
- Korte, B. (2016). Western Travel Writing 1750-1950. In C. Thompson (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 173-183). New York & London: Routledge.
- Lewis, H. (2007). The influence of Edward Said and Orientalism on Anthropology, or: Can anthropologist Speak. *Israel Affairs*, 13(4), 774-785.
- Lisle, D. (2006). *The Global Politics of Contemporary Travel Writing*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Manser, M. (2007). *The Facts on File Dictionary of Proverbs*. New York: Infobase Publishing.
- Marndi, S., & Tari, Z. G. (2012). Orientalist Feminism; Representation of Muslim Women in Two American Novels: Terrorist and Falling Man. *International Journal of Women's Research*, 1(2), 5-20.

- Matar, N. (2016). Arabic Travel Writing, to 1916. In C. Thompson (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 139-151). New York & London: Routledge.
- Marar, N. (2003). Nasiri Khusro (1003-1088) Persian Traveler. In J. Speake (Ed.), *Literature of Travel and Exploration: An Encyclopedia* (PP.673-675). New York & London: Routledge.
- Matar, N. (1996). The Representation of Muslim Women in Renaissance England. *The Muslim World*, 86(1), 50-61.
- Melman, B. (2002). The Middle East/Arabia: 'the Cradle of Islam'. In P. Hulme, & T. Youngs (Eds.), *Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 105-119). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Menon, S. (2003). Constitutive Contradictions: Travel Writing and Construction of Native Women in Colonial India. In S. Mohanty (Ed.), *Travel Writing and Empire* (pp. 100-111). New Delhi: Katha.
- Metcalf, P. (2005). *Anthropology: The Basics*. New York & Oxon: Routledge.
- Michelucci, S. (2004). L'Espace Perdu: D.H. Lawrence's Travel Writings. *Studies in Travel Writing*, 8(1), 35-48.
- Mikkelsen, J. (2015). Cultural Encounters between Europeans and Arabs: Carsten Niebuhr's Reflections on Cities of the Islamic World (1761-67). In M. Gharipour, & N. Ozlu (Eds.), *The City in the Muslims World: Depictions by Western Travel Writers* (pp. 121-142). New York & Oxon: Routledge.
- Mills, S. (1991). *Discourses of Difference: An Analysis of Women's Travel Writing and Colonialism*. New York & London: Routledge.
- Moran, M. (2006). *Victorian Literature and Culture*. London & New York: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Musgrove, B. (1999). Travel and Unsettling: Freud on Vacation. In S. Clark (Ed.), *Travel Writing and Empire: Postcolonial Theory in Transit* (pp. 31-44). London: Zed Books.
- Phillips, K. (2014). *Before Orientalism: Asian Peoples and Cultures in European Travel Writing, 1245-1510*. Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Porter, D. (1991). *Haunted Journeys: Desire and Transgression in European Travel Writing*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Said, E. (1979). *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Satapathy, A. (2012). The Idea of England in Eighteenth-Century Indian Travel Writing. *CLCWeb: Comparative Literature and Culture*, 14(2) <<http://doc.lib.prude.edu/clcweb/vol14/iss2/>>.
- Schwartz, J. (1996). The Geography Lesson: Photographs and the Construction of Imaginative Geographies. *Journal of Historical Geography*, 22(1), 16-45.
- Stagl, J., & Pinney, C. (2010). Introduction: From Travel Writing to Ethnography. *Histroy and Anthropology*, 9(2-3), 121-124.
- Starkey, P., & Starkey, J. (2001). Introduction. In P. Starkey, & J. Starkey (Eds.), *Unfolding the Orient: Travelers in Egypt and the Near East* (pp. 1-6). Lebanon: Ithaca Press.
- Stevenson, A. (2010). *Cultural Issues in Psychology: Student's Handbook*. New York & London: Routledge.
- Thompson, C. (2011). *Travel Writing*. London: Routledge.
- Thompson, C.W. (2012). *French Romantic Travel Writing: Chateaubriand to Nerval*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Thompson, C.W. (2016). The Romantic Travel Book. In C. Thompson (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion Guide to Travel Writing* (pp. 269-277). New York-London: Routledge.
- Thompson, C. (2016). Travel Writing Now, 1950 to the Present Day. In C. Thompson (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 196-213). New York & London: Routledge.
- Thurschwell, P. (2000). *Sigmund Freud*. New York & London: Routledge.
- Topping, M. (2016). Travel Writing and Visual Culture. In T. Carl (Ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* (pp. 78-88). New York & London: Routledge.
- Wazzan, A. (1993). The Arabian Nights in Western Literature: A Discourse Analysis. *Islamic Studies*, 32(1), 61-71.
- Whitfield, P. (2011). *Travel Writing: A Literary History*. Oxford: Bodleian Library University of Oxford.
- Xiaolun, W. (2006). Travel and Culture Understanding: Comparing Victorian and Chinese Literati Travel Writing. *Tourism Geographies*, 8(3), 213-232.
- Yahya, W., Ghaderi, F., & Jusoff, K. (2012). The Exotic Portrayal of Women In Isabella Bird Bishop's Journeys in Persia and Kurdistan. *Iranian Studies*, 6(6), 779-793.
- Zarrinjooee, B. (2014). Revisiting Persian Architectural Myth through Byronic Gaze in Robert Byron's *The Road to Oxiana*. *Journal of Foreign Languages, Cultures, and Civilizations*, 2(1), 159-175.

---

**Notes**

- <sup>i</sup> . Plato's concerns about lie is encapsulated in this proverb: "a traveler may lie with authority" (Manser, 2007, p.278).
- <sup>ii</sup> . This function of the travel is summarized in the following proverb: "travel broadens the mind" (ibid.).
- <sup>iii</sup> . Displaced because the quest does not takes place in the imaginary context but in a mundane world (Thompson, 2011).
- <sup>iv</sup> . This cultural phenomenon was a reaction not only against the seventeenth century Stoicism which emphasized rationality and emotional will, but also Thomas Hobbes's views that humans are selfish by nature and their behavior is motivated by the drive for gaining position and wer (Abrams, 2009).
- <sup>v</sup> . This region is located in the western Himalaya.
- <sup>vi</sup> . Maulavi means Islamic scholar (Frembgen, 2014, p.118).
- <sup>vii</sup> . This sentence uttered by Don Quixote when he encounters an Oriental veiled Muslim woman (As cited in Marandi & Tari, 2012, p.10).
- <sup>viii</sup> . This is an Urdu word which means people living in mountainous regions, it carries with a negative connotation.
- <sup>ix</sup> . All pictures are taken from the travelogue. Fig. 1. Is entitled: *Nawab with two younger brothers poising inside the watch tower*; the title of Fig.2 is: *The old Walait Nur Holding a gun with an amulet*; Fig. 3 is named, *The watch tower of Harban-cot*, and Fig. 4 is entitled , *Watchtower near the bridge of the Harban river*. The last picture appears in the front cover of the travelogue.
- <sup>x</sup> . These two pictures are taken from the travelogue. The fig.5 is entitled, *Nawa with his youngest daughter*; fig.6 is named, *Little boy in the archaic world of Harban-cot*.
- <sup>xi</sup> . It is an Arabic phrase: *فى طلب العلم*
- <sup>xii</sup> . Frembgen is regarded a savant orientalist and anthropologist because he knows Urdu and Shina, a local language in Indus valley, is familiar with Islam and is well versed in literature, folk lore, history, and archeology of Pakistan.